

Business Model Enhancement to Belibu Freshmart' Sustainability in Organic Industry

Marcellina Amanda Devina¹, Yos Sunitiyoso²

School of Business and Management, Institut Teknologi Bandung^{1,2}

Jl. Ganesa No. 10, Bandung, 40132, Indonesia

Correspondence Email: marcellinaamanda_devina@sbm-itb.ac.id

ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3474-1339>

ARTICLE INFORMATION

Publication Information

Research Article

HOW TO CITE

Devina, M.A., & Sunitiyoso, Y. (2021).
Business Model Enhancement to Belibu
Freshmart' Sustainability in Organic
Industry. *Journal of International
Conference Proceedings*, 4(3), 95-107.

DOI:

<https://doi.org/10.32535/jicp.v4i3.1302>

Copyright © year owned by Author(s).

Published by JICP



This is an open-access article.

License: Attribution-Noncommercial-Share
Alike (CC BY-NC-SA)

Received: 3 November 2021

Accepted: 9 December

Published: 11 December 2021

ABSTRACT

Belibu Freshmart is a one-stop shopping store that provides organic and healthy products in Bandung, West Java, Indonesia. Currently, Belibu Freshmart faces the problem with the fluctuated sales and how to survive doing their business, also planning for its future. For a company, business sustainability is essential to running their business in the long term. This research will examine which factors support Belibu Freshmart's sustainability. This research aims to analyze the driving forces regarding factors that could affect the business and present strategic recommendations on ways forward within the organic market in Bandung with the purpose of business sustainability. Start with business issues exploration using a fishbone diagram and problem tree analysis built from a customer survey and internal discussions. This analysis is followed by internal (VRIO analysis and value chain analysis) and external (PESTLE model and Porter's 5 Forces) condition analysis regarding the business. Then got the results by using SWOT analysis, TOWS analysis, and Triple Layered Business Model Canvas (TLBMC) that integrated with the Circular Model Economy to build sustainable business models.

Keywords: Business Sustainability, One Stop Shop, Organic Industry, Strategy Business, Triple Layered Business Model Canvas

JEL Classification: M1, Q1, Q5

INTRODUCTION

Organic agricultural production allows for the production of controlled, certified, safe, and high-quality food while also providing high economic and ecological profit and preserving a healthy environment, which has sparked consumer interest and has steadily grown over time (Golijan & Dimitrijevic, 2018). Increasing demand for organic foods, a growing emphasis on sustainable farming, rising food adulteration rates across emerging countries, investments in farm and agricultural system research and development, and growing concerns about global warming and climate change are driving the industry (Blue Weave Consulting, 2021).

Indonesia is in the third position out of 10 countries in Asia, with the largest organic area. By having the government program "1000 Organic Villages", many farmers groups have joined the program and got certified organic for trading on both domestic and international markets. The most significant growth for the global market was in organic essential oils, both for food and cosmetic ingredients. Alongside the government program, the farmers' movement led the research on organic agriculture and increased awareness regarding environmental issues (FiBL; IFOAM, 2020).

According to CNN Indonesia (2020), in this era of the Covid-19 pandemic, customer needs for healthy products have also increased, mainly organic, vegetarian, and other healthy foods. Based on organic farmers in Bandung, there has been an increase in demand for organic vegetables since March 2020, resulting in a 2-fold increase in product shipments. To restrain the virus's spread, most governments worldwide placed restrictions on many social activities. People have turned to internet purchasing to meet their needs while businesses have closed. The fastest-growing component of Internet commerce today is internet marketing. The degree of engagement between the consumer and the seller is the most significant distinction between traditional and online selling (Espinoza et al., 2021).

Many customers were interested in the new hygiene and personal care products and services launched at Covid-19. People became more aware of these products due to ads, and their purchasing habits changed. The social influence of advertising has resulted in a very excellent modification. It has encouraged people to consider life beyond their small, stable environment. Because marketers aim to influence or persuade people, society has evolved to change its way of life. (Utama, Nair, Cheng, & Daisy Mui Hung Kee, 2021)

Same with Belibu Freshmart, as a one-stop shopping store that provides organic and healthy products in Bandung, West Java, Indonesia, that jump into online commerce not only do business in the offline market. Especially with their target women who are in their active age. Currently, promotion and selling could use social media platforms in Indonesia, dominated by people aged 18 to 34. Lead by females at 19.3% in 25-34 years old (Nurhayati-Wolff, 2021).

Based on Adialita & Nurthjahjadi (2018), young adult women, single or married with children, with a medium to high-income level, are the buyers who have the necessary knowledge and frequently purchase organic food. Other customers unfamiliar with organic food bought it; they may not understand all of the aspects of the organic product, but they recognize the health benefits but not the environmental benefits.

Belibu Freshmart starts the business from a personal awareness of the importance of being grateful and maintaining health, consuming the healthy product (organic,

according to God's nature) by learning to apply mindfulness (awareness) and a sustainable lifestyle. Belibu also wants to make the closest people healthy by providing the maximum benefit by empowering local farmers and sharing other good things. By having various products, Belibu management is still trying to continuously improve the systems, products, and business to increase sales and make their business sustainable.

Currently, Belibu Freshmart faces the problem with the fluctuated sales and how to survive doing their business, also planning for its future. For a company, business sustainability is essential to running their business in the long term. This research will examine which factors support Belibu Freshmart's sustainability.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Problem Analysis

The problem analysis process consists of identifying the main issue and determining the causes and effects. This analysis will ensure that the "root causes" of the problem, not simply the symptoms, are recognized and addressed in the research.

Fishbone Diagram

A fishbone diagram (Ishikawa diagram) is a visual method for root cause analysis that organizes cause and effect relationships into categories. This method is a common approach used in cause-and-effect analyses to find a complex interplay of reasons for a particular problem or incident. Based on the result, it will build into the problem tree analysis to see the root cause and then analyze which strategy is the best for the company. Ishikawa (1990) invented this graphic in management research (Coccia, 2017).

Problem Tree Analysis

A problem tree analysis is a type of root cause analysis that identifies the core causes and effects of a problem to help stakeholders gain a realistic understanding and awareness of the issue. It will display a logical hierarchy of causes and consequences, followed by a graphic representation of their relationship (Dearder, CIDT, Jones, & Sartorius, 2003). From the development of this analysis, the focus will be on the company's human resources, marketing, and production.

External Analysis

The process assesses the business objectively by looking at the changes made to the industry and broader world that could affect the current business operation. By doing external environmental analysis, a company could adapt to changes and succeed within an industry.

PESTLE Analysis

The definition for PESTLE analysis is a framework to analyze the key factors (Political, Economic, Sociological, Technological, Legal, and Environmental) influencing an organization from the outside. A PESTLE analysis helps identify the main external opportunities and threats in the market.

Based on the research regarding the external condition, organic industry in Indonesia that organic is still growing and currently has their attention. Indonesia's government shows interest in organic and plans to develop organic farming. Following the economic situation that is getting better in Indonesia, people choose to consume organic products (health, lifestyle, animal welfare, or environment). Significantly during the pandemic,

people decide to maintain their health and decide to do online shopping, it will shift the trend and their habit by buying their needs online.

Porter's 5 Forces

Michael Porter introduced Porter's 5 Forces was in his book "Competitive Strategy: Techniques for Analyzing Industries and Competitors.". An industry is a group of competing firms that offer customers similar products or services. The industry will be analyzed in terms of five force framework portrayed the structure of an industry in terms of (Baburaj & Narayanan, 2016):

1. The threat from potential entrants
2. The bargaining power of suppliers
3. The bargaining power of buyers
4. Pressure from substitute products
5. The intensity of competitive rivalry

According to the analysis, the industry is less attractive, and Belibu will struggle to survive in this industry. However, a shift towards people who are more interested in organic and healthy food will bring more sales to Belibu. Therefore, Belibu must be able to make changes according to market conditions to take advantage of current opportunities by increasing the company's capabilities.

Internal Analysis

Internal analysis thoroughly examines internal company conditions, both tangible and intangible. Internal analysis helps the company make decisions more accurately by identifying areas for growth or revision to form a practical business strategy or business plan.

VRIO Analysis

VRIO analysis is a strategic tool that assists firms in identifying the resources and skills that provide them with a sustainable competitive advantage. Barney (1991) proposes a structured approach to analyze whether a resource is valuable, rare, and imitable and whether the organization is taking advantage of the resource to conduct a resource-based analysis.

There are the resources that have already been examined and show the impact on the company's competitive advantages. All the Belibu resources have fallen under competitive parity and temporary competitive advantages. The management needs to exploit each employee's skills to bring more advantages, especially products and services. Belibu's theme store is one kind of advantage if Belibu could control using their management to manage their daily operations. Belibu needs to improve from their internal to give their best services to their customers and sustain the business rivalry in the long term. So, in the end, it will be a company sustainable competitive advantage.

Value Chain Analysis

Value chain analysis must divide the firm into activities to understand their impact on the business unit and how they collectively impact it. It provides a perspective on how the activities add value to a product or service by emphasizing the importance of all activities (the primary and the supporting activities) and coordinating the linkages and interrelationships among activities. The first is primary activities, including the five main activities directly involving producing and selling the actual product. Inside the primary activities, there are inbound logistics, operations, outbound logistics, marketing and sales, and service. The second category is support activities. The support activities can be divided into procurement, technology development (R&D), human resource management, and firm infrastructure. (Porter, 1985).

According to the Value Chain Analysis, the primary and support activities from Belibu focuses on being different by creating differentiation advantages by giving new product ideas or services that others did not provide for the customer. Nowadays, they try to concentrate on research and development as they plan to stay ahead of the competitors without forgetting their vision and mission. With Belibu's focus on implementing a differentiation strategy, Belibu needs to make something different to propose for their consumers. Continuous product innovation and quality improvement are the keys to Belibu's products and services. Besides that, they need to focus on their suppliers and partners because both of them are their key resources. Then, Belibu needs to build and maintain a good relationship between suppliers and partners then it can always provide the necessary products by consumers.

SWOT Analysis

From the vision and mission of the company, create the objective for that company to achieve, and do the external and internal analysis, which is called SWOT analysis. While external analysis focuses on the environmental threats and opportunities faced by the company, internal analysis helps an organization understand which of its resources and capabilities are likely to be sources of competitive advantage and which are less likely to be sources of such advantages. (Gurel & TAT, 2017). After doing all the observation and analysis on the business, the SWOT Analysis in Table 1 shows the Belibu strength and weaknesses based on the internal analysis and opportunities and threats for the company based on the external analysis.

Table 1. SWOT Analysis

Strength	Weakness
S1 – Offline and Online Stores S2 – Organic Product with Own Brand S3 – Close Relationship with Customer	W1 - Unclear Organizational System W2 - Slow Inventory Stock Updated
Opportunities	Threats
O1 - Untapped Market O2 - Specified Customer	T1 - New Competitors T2 - Substitute Products

TOWS Analysis

TOWS matrix is the essential complementing tool closely related to SWOT Analysis. This analysis is built from the variation of SWOT analysis related to identifying the company's strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats. TOWS analysis aims to see the compatibility between internal and external factors to help identify the relevant strategy to implement it. Besides that, it can help companies take advantage of existing opportunities, reduce threats, overcome weaknesses, and exploit their strengths. Based on the SWOT analysis, all the factors will fall into four quadrants with the different strategic situations, which are Strength-Opportunities (SO), Weakness-Opportunities (WO), Strength-Threat (ST), Weakness-Threat (WT) strategies. Belibu will focus more on how the business could maximize the strength and opportunities that Belibu already has, such as the online and offline market, by continuously improving their staff skills and managing product innovation.

Triple Layer Business Model Canvas

The Triple-Layered Business Model Canvas is a tool for exploring sustainability-oriented business model innovation processes (TLBMC). This tool adds an environmental layer based on a lifecycle perspective and a social layer based on a stakeholder perspective to Osterwalder and Pigneur's (2010) Business Model Canvas. Using TLBMC provides a straightforward way to visualize and discuss a business model's multiple and diverse impacts by allowing economic, environmental, and social value to be explored

horizontally and vertically within their layers. Also, to provide a framework to support visualization, communication, and collaboration around innovating more sustainable business models. Belibu, who wants to have a sustainable business, could innovate towards more sustainable business models that require developing new business models beyond an economic focus to generate and integrate economic, environmental, and social value through an organization's activities. (Joyce & Paquin, 2016).

RESEARCH METHOD

This research aims to analyze the driving forces regarding factors affecting the business and present strategic recommendations. Then this research utilizes qualitative methods to better understand this research topic from other people's perspectives that have their hands on in this business. The primary data are collected to get an insight into the related problem using research questions. The primary data is gathered by interviewing the key person of Belibu Freshmart and from the customers. The secondary data will be collected information related to the organic industry, especially in Indonesia. The external data will be obtained from research, journal, government, and documents. Later from this data, the researcher will build into the analysis and get the result as the new business model for Belibu Freshmart to run the business in the long term.

RESULTS

According to all the analysis, we got the result to build the business model canvas to enhance Belibu Freshmart's business to sustain in the long term. Figure 1 shows about economics business model canvas as the first layer of Triple Layer Business Model Canvas.

Figure 1. Economic of TLBMC for Belibu Freshmart

Economic Business Model Canvas				
Key Partners 1. Local Organic Farmers 2. Healthy Product Supplier 3. Online Driver and Courier Services 4. Belibu Ambassadors 5. Collaboration with Experts (e.g., nutritionist, pediatrician, etc.) 6. Organic and health community	Key Activities 1. Producing Belibu Product 2. Sales & Marketing 3. R&D New Product 4. Product Distribution 5. Customer Service 6. Maintaining Trust & Brand Image 7. Waste Management Key Resources 1. Organic Farmers 2. Healthy Product Supplier 3. Well manage Management with Skilled Employees	Value Proposition 1. Organic Product 2. Healthy Product 3. One stop shopping store 4. Fast delivery 5. Less waste product with more long life cycle product	Customer Relationships 1. Sharing knowledge using media social (Instagram, Website, Whatsapp Story) 2. Interaction between customers & Bumin (Belibu Admin) by Whatsapp, another social media and offline market 3. Activities to attract customer (e.g., promotion, discount, quiz & challenges) 4. Maintaining Product Quality and Quantity (as per standard) Channels 1. Offline Store (Jl. Reog & Jl. Cigadung) 2. Online Store (Shopee, Tokopedia, website) 3. Social Media (Instagram, Whatsapp, TikTok)	Customer Segments 1. Young Adult (18-24 y.o.) 2. Super Moms (25-45 y.o.) 3. Senior Super Moms (46-64 y.o.)
Cost Structure 1. Production 2. Marketing 3. Infrastructure 4. R&D Cost 5. Employees		Revenue Streams 1. On the spot shopping 2. Online shopping		

The Belibu Freshmart business concept aims to provide Indonesian families with organic and healthy products by offering a one-stop shopping store, especially for mothers who frequently shop for their families. Belibu has a local partner who supplies the products. At the same time, the delivery uses an online driver and courier services if they do inter-island shipping. Belibu also works together with Belibu ambassadors to do promotion. It contains all of the information about the currently on sale products. Customers must know what something is for and how it works before purchasing it. Marketing is the most effective technique of communicating the value offered to clients. It is intended to maintain a business presence where businesses must invest, grow, and work every day to survive and thrive (Kee, Murthy, Ganasen, Lingam, & Chandran, 2021). They have mothers or wives who use social media to share and influence others based on their

lifestyle. Its match with Belibu product wants to share a healthy lifestyle and influence others to consume the organic product for their goods.

Belibu could get support from a pediatrician, nutritionist, or environmental activist as an expert in their field to help share knowledge regarding the benefit of Belibu's product and promote it, particularly when Belibu has product innovation to prolong the life cycle product to improve the less-waste value as one of Belibu's targets. Joining an organic community that has indirectly gathered the target segment of Belibu could also increase Belibu brand awareness and image trust. All of these operations could be smoothly running if they support by good management, particularly the employee skill to do their responsibility.

In the following section, the ensuing environmental and social canvas layers are presented, and that the result is by expanding on Belibu's business model. First, the extension of the Business Model Canvas will be shown by building the environmental life cycle of the TLBMC.

Figure 2. Environmental Life Cycle of TLBMC for Belibu Freshmart

Environmental Life Cycle of TLBMC				
<u>Supplies & Outsourcing</u> 1. Water for processes 2. Energy for processes 3. Glass jar production 4. Brown kraft paper packaging 5. Ziplock packaging	<u>Production</u> 1. Production by implementing 3R values 2. R&D process for product innovation to get longer life cycle product <u>Materials</u> 1. Harvest product 2. Inorganic material for packaging product	<u>Functional Value</u> The primary product that customer consume in one year 1. Organic and healthy product (fruits, vegetables, meat) 2. Herbs 3. Variant Belibu products	<u>End of Life</u> 1. Waste management of the waste material from the perishable product 2. Machine end of life 3. Potential for development of circular economies to treat the waste material <u>Distribution</u> 1. Supply distribution from supplier – store - customer 2. Packaging from the distribution process	<u>Use of Phase</u> 1. Raw material and packaging preparation (energy and water usage) 2. Machine use for production (energy and use) 3. Returnable packaging (water usage)
<u>Environmental Impacts</u> Energy and water usage in all processes in production		<u>Environmental Benefits</u> 1. Less waste by managing longer life cycle product 2. Waste management		

Functional value

The functional value describes a business's service output point of focus. Belibu's functional values are organic and healthy products, herbs, and other Belibu product variants provided in stores to serve Belibu customers. These products are consumed the most in one year, assuming based on sales records originating from Belibu customers.

Materials

The materials component is the environmental extension of the key resource's component from the original business model canvas. In this section, materials are referred to the bio-physical stocks used to get the functional value. For Belibu, primary materials are all the harvest products available in the stores and the inorganic packaging included in the life cycle materials. These are the key material for the organization that has an environmental impact, such as contributing to the carbon footprint. Also, organic agriculture contributes to helping the environment by eliminating chemicals usage and restoring the soil and water quality.

Production

The production component of the business model canvas extends the key resources component to the environmental layer, capturing the actions that the organization takes to produce value. Like the materials, production will focus on the organization's core and have a high environmental impact. Belibu tries using 3R ways to have circular product

flow and continuously innovate products to have a longer life cycle. The goals of these actions are to achieve one of their mission which is to implement the 3R (reduce – reuse – recycle) values.

Supplies and Outsourcing

Supplier and outsourcing depict various other materials and productive activities necessary for operational value but not considered their core. Belibu has water and energy for processing their product, also for the packaging that they relied a lot upon the supplier for the glass jar, brown kraft paper, and zip lock packaging. These parts could support the organization's competitive advantage, which is necessary but not unique.

Distribution

Based on the original business model, distribution involves the transportation of goods. However, the environmental layer combines transportation modes, distance traveled, and the weights of what is shipped, which is to be considered. As well, issues of packaging may become paramount here. For Belibu, distribution was in distribution flow from the supplier to store, usually brought from the farm then distributed by the dealer to their customer. Belibu then continues to be distributed to the branch store and later delivered to the customer when the consumer has made the order. In addition, the products are packed in cardboard boxes, big bags, and plastic for the distribution process.

Use phase

The use phase focuses on the impact of the customers' share in the organization's functional value or core product or service. These matters would include maintenance and repair of products when appropriate and should consider the client's material resource and energy requirements through use. For Belibu, the use phase consists of raw material and packaging preparation, machines used for production, and returnable packaging that will use the customer's water and energy as one element in the life cycle of Belibu's carbon impact.

End-of-Life

When the customer chooses to end the consumption of the functional value and often entails issues of material reuse such as remanufacturing, repurposing, recycling, disassembly, incineration, or disposal of a product, it is the meaning of the end-of-life of the product or services. From an environmental perspective, this component supports the organization in exploring ways to manage its impact through extending its responsibility beyond the initially conceived value of its products.

For Belibu, addressing the effects of organic materials and machinery for production in a mix of end-of-life scenarios that includes landfill and recycling adds up the Belibu's total carbon impact. Regarding the return packaging jar from the customer, it can only be reused if taken back to the Belibu store, so it takes the customer's will. Additionally, Belibu is a form of an organic one-stop shopping store. It would be helpful to examine if there are opportunities for more partners to be involved in the Belibu supply chain and explore opportunities for the development of circular economies in the field of the organic industry as part of a broader initiative for the transformation of the organic community.

Environmental Impacts

The environmental costs of the organization's actions are addressed in the component of the environmental impact. For Belibu, energy and water usage is the most significant impact on the environment, which is the side effects of the use of phase. From handling raw material, production, packaging, and handling finished good will use energy and water as their resource.

Environmental Benefits

Similar to the relationship between environmental impacts and costs, environmental benefits enhance the concept of value creation beyond purely financial value. It limits the organization's ecological value by reducing environmental impact and creating value by developing a positive environmental culture. It encompasses the ecological value the organization creates through environmental impact reductions and even regenerative positive environmental value.

From the sustainability perspective, this component provides space for an organization to explore product, service, and business model innovations that could reduce harmfully or increase positive environment through its actions. For Belibu, improving the waste management system could improve waste handling and help reduce greenhouse gas. Also, doing product innovation to achieve less waste could be one of the preventive actions by Belibu to protect the environment, reduce waste and increase their profit.

Figure 3. Social Stakeholder of TLBMC for Belibu Freshmart

Social Stakeholder of TLBMC				
Local Communities	Governance	Social Value	Societal Culture	End of User
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Local product suppliers Local organic farmer Local consumer community (e.g., the health community, organic community) 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Collaboration between the team Decentralized system 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Enhance customer's life quality by providing an organic and healthy product Support local SMEs and organic farmers by getting the supply from them Belibu social responsibility for the people and environment (e.g., donation, 3R values) 	<p>Organic product is one of the best choices for improving people's healthiness and environment.</p> <p><u>Scale of Outreach</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Offline Store (Jl. Reog & Jl. Cigadung) in Bandung area Online Store (Shopee, Tokopedia, website) for fresh food only in Jabodetabek, dry food all in Indonesia area Social Media (Instagram, Whatsaap, TikTok) for all media social user Content collaboration with supplier or partner in social media or offline event Training and development skills for employees 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Customer who wants consume the safe product (organic and healthy products) Customers who switch from conventional products
Social Impacts		Social Benefits		
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Transition from conventional to organic farming will give impact to other farmers who couldn't get the support in knowledge or financial (the transition process is long and need enough fund) Potential organic products are viewed as expensive products only 		<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Customer engagement by sharing knowledge regarding the organic and healthy products to improving people's quality of life Improve environment by reducing the waste material and implementing 3R values 		

Social Value

The component of an organization's goal that focuses on providing benefit for its stakeholders and society at large is referred to as social value. Creating social value is undoubtedly an explicit component of the aim of sustainability-oriented businesses. Even the most profit-driven firms, on the other hand, are likely to examine their value-creation potential in addition to financial gain. Can extrapolate a broader understanding of the company's social value from the business principles which to enhance customer's life quality by providing organic and healthy products, support local SMEs and organic farmers by getting the supply from them and have a social responsibility for the people and environment (e.g., donation, 3R values).

Employee

The employees' component provides a space to consider the role of employees as core organizational stakeholders. Some elements may be included here, such as amounts and types of employees, gender, education, and variations pay within the organizations. Moreover, to provide a space for discussing how an organization trains its employees to improve skills as support programs to contribute to its long-term success. However, this part will be focusing more on the most relevant factor for supporting the organization's business. Belibu's employees consist of young people who could continuously bring fresh and creative ideas to help Belibu's business and provide

them with a training program to improve their hard and soft skills. Also, in Belibu, the main focus is the customer relationship that employees create with the customer through the offline or online market.

Governance

The governance component captures the organizational structure and decision-making policies of an organization. Governances specify the stakeholders the organization is supposed to identify and engage with and how the business is expected to do so. For Belibu, management wants to build a solid team that could build teamwork with their collaboration and transparency. Also, the system should be decentralized, which means every manager holds their responsibility and implement the job description as per their function. The leader only acts as a supervisor and guides in general. So, the team could explore and run the business with their team based on one target that the leader has already set.

Local Communities

While economic relationships are built with business partners, social relationships are made with the supplier and their local communities. These two stakeholders come together as communities when aligning the three layers of the TLBMC. When collaborating with other communities, an organization's success can be significantly influenced through developing and maintaining mutually beneficial relationships. In Belibu, the supplier is locally based on the local farmer and local product supplier. Even some suppliers could have more or less influence over an organization, but all of them are critical as they provide the organization with the resource materials locally. Belibu also needs to join the local communities with the same interest as Belibu, such as the organic community, the health community, the mother community, or the environmental community.

Societal Culture

The societal culture component relates to an organization's potential impact on society. This component influences the concept of sustainable value because businesses cannot succeed when society fails. Belibu built the culture regarding organic and healthy products that could improve people's health, also contribute to the environment. Besides selling the product, Belibu tries to share knowledge and build communication with their customer to stay connected with them and make them loyal as organic consumers and follow each step to consider the ways to take care of the environment.

Scale of Outreach

The scale of outreach refers to the depth and breadth of relationships that an organization develops with its stakeholders with their efforts over time. In Belibu's case, the goal is to build long-lasting relationships between their partner and customer. So, Belibu manages its offline and online store to reach and stay connected with all their customer. Also, by using social media to share content and collaborate with Belibu partners to share knowledge products and do promotion together, and could give back to the customer and community. Not to be missed, Belibu holds training and development for their employees to improve their services for managing the operational and serving their customers.

End-Users

We define the person who "consumes" the value proposition as end-users. This block is concerned with how the value proposition addresses the end user's needs, contributing to the customer's quality of life. Notably, the end-user is not always the customer as defined in the economic layer of the business model canvas. For Belibu, the end-user is their customer searching for safer and healthy products based on their

knowledge. By consuming organic and healthy products (e.g., gluten-free, no preservatives, no artificial flavor), they could improve their lifestyle and enhance the environment by choosing organic agriculture rather than conventional agriculture.

Social Impacts

The social costs of an organization are addressed in the social impact's component. It adds to and expands the financial cost of the economic layer and the environmental layer's bio-physical consequences. For Belibu, the social impact is that if there is a shifting trend to organic products, from conventional to organic farming, it will impact the conventional farmer that still does not shift to the organic because it needs quite a lot of time and funds, and knowledge. Also, the market will see organic as a high-price product that as an impact, there are still not many organic farmers and organic product suppliers.

Social Benefits

Social benefits are the positive social value-creating aspects of the organization's activities, and this component is for explicitly considering the social benefits of an organization's actions. By selling organic products, Belibu wants to share the benefit and knowledge of organic and healthy products to improve people's lifestyles. Also, by running the business to help improve the environment by reducing the waste material and implementing 3R values in the daily operations.

DISCUSSION

The factors that affect business sustainability for Belibu are related to these factors to support the business sustainability:

1. **Human resources**
Management and employees need to integrate the exact directions, goals, guidelines, and measurements. Collaboration and transparent communication could help each individual directly execute all the business processes to support the business. Continuous improvement is a must for human resource management to adapt to fast changes.
2. **Production**
Emerging competitors make Belibu need to stay alert and creatively focus on their product and process to be different from others. Product management is also essential to serve excellent services for the customer. So, customers are eager to shop at Belibu, especially with the one-stop shopping theme store.
3. **Marketing**
Exposure is vital for a business as it needs to know by the customer. Expanding the network could reach a broader potential market. Currently, online marketing is the easiest and fastest way but a tricky way to attract customers. Also, they need great content proposed to the customer, so they easily engaged with Belibu. They need to pay attention to the trend market to be a leader in the organic industry and maximize the offline market that Belibu already has opportunities in compared to others.

TLBMC creates a detailed visual representation of a company's business model. As previously stated, each layer of the TLBMC supports horizontal coherence by concentrating on essential activities and linkages among the components of each layer as it analyzes economic, environmental, and social impacts. When the three levels are combined, by connecting the components of each layer to their analogs in the other layers, elaborating on important actions and relationships and their influence across layers, the business can achieve vertical consistency. This business model gives

potential customers a more comprehensive perspective of the company and a better understanding of its value creation (Pardalis, Mahaptra, & Mainali, 2020).

Horizontal Consistency

The "one-stop shopping" store business model offers its customers all daily necessities, especially main food products such as vegetables, fruit, and meat, complemented by other household needs. When the customer comes to the store, it can fulfill their needs as a whole. At the environmental level, the Belibu concept aims to improve the quality of the environment by starting from internal Belibu, such as implementing waste management and less waste production as one of Belibu's ways to support the environment. Belibu tries to apply the 3R value for each of its production processes. In addition, Belibu needs customer assistance to help Belibu's businesses run programs that have been planned so that one of Belibu's goals to protect the environment can be achieved. At the social level, Belibu aims to maximize local partners in supplying goods to Belibu so that Belibu can participate in the welfare of these local partners. Another dimension of social value is the creation of awareness from consumers and potential consumers to understand better the function of organic and healthy products that can improve their quality of life. However, this action needs support by existing stakeholders such as Belibu employees, who must continue to improve their skills to help Belibu run their business. By using TLBMC, Belibu can identify problems, such as further discussion with consumers about what they are looking for from a "one-stop shopping" store. Moreover, this business model canvas enables Belibu to develop solutions that will meet the actual needs of customers and provide more excellent value.

Vertical Consistency

Vertical coherence is achieved by aligning each layer component across the canvas layers. This TLBMC supports exploring the alignment of actions and interconnections across the different value types. With Belibu, one may see a lack of alignment across the canvas layers regarding the connection between its key activities, end-of-user actions, and end-of-life actions. As one of Belibu's plans to become a sustainable business, Belibu designs waste management to support the surrounding environment. However, there is a slight misalignment with the end-user and end life of Belibu products. Because Belibu plans to help the environment by increasing the end of life, they still need the consumer's desire where they are the end-users of Belibu.

CONCLUSION

Based on the analysis, human resources, marketing, and production factors are the most significant factors supporting Belibu's sustainability. By focusing on these factors, Belibu could improve the business strategy based on the new proposed Triple Layer Business Model Canvas using the circular model economy that implemented to the factors that build the business strategy and business model enhancement for Belibu Freshmart.

LIMITATION

The researcher could not meet directly with the consumer due to the public restriction during Covid-19 in Bandung, Indonesia. So, the interview was only based on an online survey, for the data collection limited only from Belibu Freshmart in Bandung based on internal data and observation from July 2019 - July 2021.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

We gratefully thank Belibu Freshmart's management and team for their great assistance and cooperation in data acquisition for this research.

DECLARATION OF CONFLICTING INTERESTS

There is no conflicting interest while the researcher does the research.

REFERENCES

- Adialita, T., & Nurtjahjadi, E. (2018). Organic Food Consumer's Profile Based on Their Knowledge in Bandung. *The 2018 International Conference of Organizational Innovation*, 52-63. DOI: 10.18502/kss.v3i10.3360
- Baburaj, Y. & Narayanan, V. (2016). Five Forces Framework, s.l.: Palgrave Connect. DOI: 10.1057/978-1-349-94848-2_632-1
- Barney, J., 1991. Firm Resources and Sustained Competitive Advantage. *Journal of Management*, 17(1), pp. 99-120.
- Blue Weave Consulting. (2021, August). Retrieved from www.blueweaveconsulting.com: <https://www.blueweaveconsulting.com/report/global-organic-farming-market>
- CNN Indonesia. (2020). Corona Effect, Demand for Organic Vegetables Soars. [Online] Available at: <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/ekonomi/20200629100435-92-518488/efek-corona-permintaan-sayur-organik-melonjak> [Accessed 16 November 2021].
- Coccia, M. (2017). The Fishbone Diagram to Identify, Systematize and Analyze the Sources of General Purpose Technologies. *Journal of Social and Administrative Sciences*, 4(4), pp. 291-303. DOI : 10.1453/jsas.v4i4.1518
- Dearder, P., CIDT, Jones, S., & Sartorius, R. (2003, March). *Tools for Development - A handbook for those engaged in development activity*. Wolverhampton: Department for International Development.
- FiBL; IFOAM. (2020). Retrieved from <https://www.arc2020.eu/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/organic-world-2020.pdf>
- Golijan, J. & Dimitrijevic, B. (2018). Global Organic Food Market. *Acta Agriculturae Serbica*, XXIII(46), pp. 125-140. DOI : DOI: 10.5937/AASer1846125G
- Gurel, E. & Tat, M. (2017). SWOT Analysis : A Theoretical Review. *The Journal of International Social Research*, 10(51), pp. 994-1006. DOI : 10.17719/jisr.2017.1832
- Joyce, A. & Paquin, R. L. (2016). The Triple Layered Business Model Canvas : A Tool to Design More Sustainable Business Models. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Issue 135, pp. 1474-1486. DOI : <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.06.067>
- Kee, D. M., Murthy, R., Ganasen, R., Lingam, R. R., & Chandran, R. (2021). The Impact of Marketing on Customer Loyalty : A Study of Dutch Lady in Malaysia. *International Journal Of Accounting & Finance in Asia Pasific (IJAFAP)*, 31-41. DOI : 10.32535/ijafap.v4i3.1203
- Nurhayati-Wolff, H. (2021, August 9). Retrieved from [statista.com](https://www.statista.com/statistics/997297/indonesia-breakdown-social-media-users-age-gender/): <https://www.statista.com/statistics/997297/indonesia-breakdown-social-media-users-age-gender/>
- Osterwalder, A. & Pigneur, Y. (2010). Business Model Canvas. In: T. Clark, ed. *Business Model Generation*. Hoboken, New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., p. 44.
- Pardalis, G., Mahaptra, K., & Mainali, B. (2020). A Triple-Layered One-Stop-Shop Business Model Canvas for Sustainable House Renovations. *BEYOND 2020 - World Sustainable Built Environment Conference*, 1-16. DOI : 10.1088/1755-1315/588/2/022060
- Porter, M. E. (1985). The Value Chain. In: *Competitive Advantage : Creating and Sustaining Superior Performance*. New York: The Free Press, p. 36.
- Utama, A. G., Nair, R. K., Cheng, W. E., & Daisy Mui Hung Kee, Z. C. (2021). Influences of Advertisement on Buying Behaviour. *International Journal of Accounting & Finance in Asia Pasific (IJAFAP)*, 17-30. DOI : 10.32535/ijafap.v4i3.1202