

## Implementation of Character Education Values in Orphanages (Literature Review)

Theo Chanra Merentek<sup>1</sup>, Hetwi Marselina Saerang<sup>2</sup>, Dani Lantang<sup>3</sup>, Shelly Deity Meity Sumual<sup>4</sup>

Universitas Negeri Manado<sup>1,2,3,4</sup>

Jl. Kampus Unima, Tonsaru, Kec. Tondano Sel., Kabupaten Minahasa, Sulawesi Utara 95618

Correspondence email: [theochanra@gmail.com](mailto:theochanra@gmail.com)

### ARTICLE INFORMATION

#### Publication information

#### Research article

#### HOW TO CITE

Merentek, T. C., Saerang, H. M., Lantang, D., & Sumual, S. D. M. (2022). Implementation of character education values in orphanages (Literature Review). *Journal of International Conference Proceedings*, 5(5), 22-31.

#### DOI:

<https://doi.org/10.32535/jicp.v5i5.2037>

Copyright©2022 owned by Author(s).  
Published by JICP



This is an open-access article.

License:

The Creative Commons Attribution-Non Commercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-SA 4.0)

Received: 11 October 2022

Accepted: 29 November 2022

Published: 24 December 2022

#### ABSTRACT

An orphanage is an institution that replaces the role of parents in nurturing, maintaining, caring for, and educating children. This study aims to describe the implementation of character education values, obstacles, and efforts made in orphanages. This study uses a literature review method. The data collection technique used google scholar with the keywords "implementation of character education values" and "character education in orphanages". The number of articles reviewed is 10 articles. The results of the research from these 10 articles show that the implementation of character education values in orphanages comes from 18 Pancasila character values, but only 3 appear to be implemented consistently, namely religious, tolerant and democratic. The obstacles faced are that it takes a long time to foster children's character due to differences in background, caregivers do not prioritize character education, lack of infrastructure and human resources while the efforts made are to give roles to social volunteers to maximize human resources in fostering foster children, establish cooperation with the community, making orphanages like their own family environment.

**Keywords:** Application of Character Education, Application of Values, Character Education Values, Orphanages, Pancasila Values, The Role of Caregivers.

## INTRODUCTION

Educational institutions have the authority and full responsibility for making decisions regarding the needs, capabilities, and demands of institutions and society, especially those related to education (Ratih, Naharia, & Sumual, 2022). Education is one of the keywords in various efforts to improve the quality of life as human beings in which it has the role of an object to humanize humans (Rawung, Katuuk, Rotty, & Lengkong, 2021). Every human being has the right to get an education, including character education. Amid various challenges and dynamics of the nation's life which are illustrated by multiple deviations from the fundamental nature of life such as corruption, illegal fees, and gratuities that are spreading and spreading everywhere involving various people and institutions, implementing character education in multiple fields of life is an alternative guide. way to get out of each of these problems. In various discussions, the public believes that the most basic problem of moral and ethical degradation lies in the bad character and behavior of the younger generation (Lintong, Rawis, Senduk, & Lengkong, 2021). The most fatal failure in education is when the product resulting from the previous educational process does not have a conscience based on morality, and a sense of humanity, and the problem of moral decline is increasingly widespread (Saneba, Katuuk, Rotty, & Lengkong, 2021).

Character education has continued to be promoted since Indonesia's independence, the proof is that since the leadership of President Soekarno, nation and character building has been proclaimed to build and develop the character of the Indonesian nation to achieve the nation's ideals, namely a just and prosperous society by the 5th precepts of Pancasila, then continued on President Soeharto's leadership with the declaration of *Eka Prasetya Pancakarsa* or what we are often familiar with *Pedoman Penghayatan dan Pengamalan Pancasila* (P4). Meanwhile, in the current reform era, character education remains a priority in education in Indonesia. This certainly provides evidence to us that character education is a new thing in Indonesia.

Character education in formal educational institutions is the most basic need to be carried out so that the next generation will be equipped with basic skills that are not only able to make them lifelong learners as one of the important characteristics to exist in the information age that covers globally but also has a positive function. in personal life as well as family members, citizens, and citizens of the world (Dakir, 2019). Character education is always interpreted as value, character, moral, and character education which has the aim of developing children's abilities to assess and make decisions about the good and bad things that are temporary and they will (Sani & Kadri, 2016). The core purpose of character education is to form a nation that is strong, competitive, noble, moral, tolerant, cooperative, patriotic, dynamically developing, and oriented to science and technology, all of which are based on faith and piety to God Almighty. based on Pancasila values (Hendriana & Jacobus, 2016).

The orphanage is one part of the educational entity that has a role that cannot be underestimated in character education. The orphanage is part of the role of the community in the informal sector which is Also responsible for progress in education, especially character education. UU no. 20 of 2003 Article 13 paragraph 1 states that the implementation of education has three channels, namely formal, non-formal and informal which in practice can complement each other (Pemerintah Indonesia, 2003). Orphanages as a forum for nurturing, fostering, and empowering the poor, abandoned children, orphans, and other social problems, orphanages are also institutions that replace the role of parents of foster children in providing education which is one of the spearheads in giving birth to the nation's generation. character. An orphanage is an

institution that provides comprehensive services to children who are being cared for to get the right to education.

## **LITERATURE REVIEW**

### **Character Building**

Etymologically, the word character is derived from the Greek word (Greek), namely *charassein* which means "to engrave". The word "engraved" can be translated as engraving, painting, sculpt, or inscribe. In the online version of the KBBI, characters are psychological, moral or character traits that distinguish one person from another; character; character. Character is a unique trait – good values (knowing values, wanting to do good, actually living good) that are ingrained in the self and expressed in behavior (Mulyasa, 2011).

Education is meaningful as a consciously planned and carried out process to change the attitudes and behavior of a person or group in an effort to continuously mature humans, this is in line with (Undang-Undang Nomor 20 Tahun 2003) which states that:

Education is a conscious and planned effort to create a learning atmosphere and learning process so that students actively develop their potential to have religious spiritual strength, self-control, personality, intelligence, noble character, and the skills needed by themselves, society, nation and state.

Character education is a conscious and planned effort to create an atmosphere and process that empowers and unleashes students' potential in order to build individual or collective good personalities as individuals and groups. way as citizens (Mulyasa, 2011). Based on the above understanding, it can be concluded that character education is a conscious and planned efforts to realize the process of empowering and cultivating human potential or groups to become human beings who can humanize humans. In principle, character education has a goal to form a nation that is strong, competitive, moral, tolerant, cooperative and so on which is based on the values of faith and devotion to God Almighty and Pancasila.

### **Character Education Values**

The values of character education in Indonesia are derived from the values of Pancasila by the regulation of the President of the Republic of Indonesia No. 87 of 2017 concerning Strengthening Character Education which includes religious values, honesty, tolerance, discipline, hard work, creativity, independent, democratic, sense of belonging. curiosity, national spirit, love for the homeland, respect for achievement, communication, love for peace, love to read, care for the environment, care for society, and being responsible.

Character education is very urgent to do because not a few young people hurt each other because of the low level of awareness about moral values. One of the most important functions of civilization is to impart moral values to the younger generation. Schools bear a heavy responsibility because fewer and fewer children are taught about morals by parents, society, or religious institutions. Character values that are still generally accepted are honesty, justice, courtesy, democratic process, and respect for the truth. In character education, democracy is treated specifically because the rules about democracy are based on the people, by the people, and for the people. Value-free education does not exist. Commitment to character of education is crucial in case you need and remain a great teacher. Character education that is carried out effectively can make students more civilized, care about others, and can increase academic abilities (Lickona, 2019)

### Orphanage

Regulation of the Minister of Social Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia No. 30/HUK/2011 Article 2 explains that an orphanage is a child social welfare institution established by the government, both local and central government, and the community in providing care for children (KEMENSOS RI, 2010). As an institution that is directly related to foster children, the orphanage is the center of coaching and education (Muhsin, 2003). The orphanage is one of the social institutions that has been around for a long time, founded by religious communities that still survive to this day (Latief, 2010).

### RESEARCH METHOD

This study uses a literature review. The literature review method aims to collect and then absorb the basics of previous research and analyze some of the expert opinions written in the text (Snyder, 2019, p. 333). Literature review plays a very important role as the basis for various types of research because the results of a literature review can provide insight into changes in knowledge, trigger new ideas and ideas and can be useful as a guide for research in certain fields (Snyder, 2019, p. 339). science normally aims to expand theory (Merentek, 2022, p. 7). The database used is Google Scholar and uses the Mendeley Reference Manager to manage the journal articles obtained. Search using an internet connection to observe additional information from previously published research articles related to the implementation of character education values in orphanages using the keywords "implementation of character education values" and "character education in orphanages" with a search time limit determined from the span of 2014-2022.

### RESULTS

The review process was carried out on 10 scientific articles that had been selected with the keywords on Google Scholar "implementation of character education values" and "character education in orphanages". The scientific articles obtained are then reviewed based on the author's name, year, location, type of research, and research results. The following articles have gone through the review process.

**Table 1.** Results of Review of Journal Articles

No	Author, Year	Location	Type of Research	Results
1.	Sidik, Zohriah, and Firdaos (2022)	Muhammadiyah Orphanage in Serang City	Qualitative	All resources are utilized in the implementation of character education values starting from the application of the coaching curriculum, educational staff, educators, and the involvement of public relations in implementing education aimed at fostering the character of foster children.
2.	Hidayat (2021)	Halimatussa'diyah Muhammadiyah Palopo Orphanage	Quantitative descriptive Field Research	The implementation of the value of character building through religious education for children in orphanages is very good in terms of the morals, morals, and

				behavior of orphaned children.
3.	Malviana and Luviadi (2021)	Bandar Lampung City Orphanage Foundation	Quantitative	Character education is carried out through verbal and non-verbal which are implemented through daily attitudes including hugging, embracing, greeting, and setting an example. Meanwhile, the application of character values is empathy, respect, and tolerance. The character values that are implemented are applied to children through attention, approach, and supervision of children in orphanages.
4.	Afriani, Salam, and Usmanto (2021)	Taman Bina Insani Orphanage Jambi City.	Quantitative descriptive	The practice of character education imbued with religious values and cooperation through curricula, rules, methods and sanctions can develop religious character and cooperation in adopted children.
5.	Hasanah and Suwanda (2020)	Nurul Falah Mojokerto Orphanage	Quantitative descriptive	The implementation of character-building values occurs through the development of interests and talents that can shape a courageous spirit, strong self-confidence, and mastery of good and positive religious values.
6.	Aliyah and Sholikhah (2019)	Darul Hadlanah Orphanage Salatiga City	Quantitative	The implementation of character education values based on faith and godliness is carried out by methods of education, example, habituation, story methods, worship, and extra activities to develop child care knowledge, attitudes and skills
7.	Lestari (2016)	Nurul Hidayah Orphanage	Qualitative Field Research	Character education at the orphanage is strived to develop intellectual and spiritual intelligence with different parenting backgrounds. Through the direction and evaluation of the entire board of the

				Orphanage; spiritual guidance and counseling; synergistic control of children's sexual relations by caregivers.
8.	Muhammad, Hambali, and Eddison (2015)	As-Shohwah Orphanage Pekanbaru City	Quantitative descriptive	The implementation of religious character values that are well implemented is rejected. The researcher concludes that the study of the implementation of religious character values in the orphanage is not good.
9.	Sarujin (2014)	Orphanage at Makassar City	Qualitative Field Research	Authoritarian, democratic and permissive are the three models of the pattern of education applied by the orphanage but of the three patterns of education, the pattern of democratic education is the most dominant.
10.	Silvia and Angraini (2018)	Aisyiah Orphanage, Agam Regency	Quantitative descriptive	The implementation of the values of character education in orphanage children is through religious, spiritual, professional and intellectual instruction.

The results of a review of 10 scientific articles that have been published previously, it was found that the implementation of character education values in orphanages came from:

“Pancasila values which include religious values, honest, tolerant, disciplined, hardworking, creative, independent, democratic, curiosity, national spirit, love for the motherland, respect for achievement, communicative, love peace, love to read, care for the environment, socially caring and responsible” (Pemerintah Indonesia, 2017).

## DISCUSSION

### Implementation of Character Education Values at the Orphanage

Implementation or application can be said as an action or implementation of a plan that has been prepared in a structured, systematic, and detailed manner. In the process of building human character, it is not easy, detailed stages are needed to produce superior human characters with various challenges and strong environmental influences. This is where educators are needed who do not just transfer knowledge, attitudes, and skills (Merentek, Sumual, Ushoh, & Rotty, 2022).

By the results of previous research, the implementation of character education values in orphanages comes from 18 Pancasila values and the most visible are religious, tolerant, and democratic values. The existence of 18 values that form the nation's character does not necessarily mean that every educational institution, especially in informal education such as orphanages, follows all of them simultaneously, but each orphanage has the freedom to determine which priorities will be developed first. In its application, it can be

started from the most essential values, simple and easy to implement by existing conditions (Hendriana & Jacobus, 2016). The following describes the implementation of character education values in orphanages according to the results of the reviews of 10 previous research articles.

### **Religious**

Religious values are a reflection of faith and devotion to Almighty God, which is realized in behavior (Indrawan et al., 2020, p. 131). The results of research conducted by Sidik, Zohriah, and Firdaos (2022), explained that in realizing the value of character education in an orphanage requires the use of all resources, starting with the implementation of coaching curricula, the management of educators and educational staff, and the involvement of the community in character-building education. Implementation of self-development through religious education that is carried out every day for orphans has an effect on children's morals which are marked by respecting elders, diligence in worship, and honesty with friends and orphanage administrators (Hidayat, 2021). The role of orphanages in instilling religious character education can develop the religious character of foster children (Afriani et al., 2021; Aliyah & Sholikhah, 2019; Hasanah & Suwanda, 2020; Silvia & Angraini, 2018).

### **Tolerant**

Tolerance is attitudes and actions that respect the differences of religion, ethnicity, opinions, attitudes and actions of others who differ from one's own (Dakir, 2019, p. 129). The results of research conducted by Malviana and Ahmad Luviadi (2021), explained that inculcating the value of tolerance in orphanages was carried out by providing understanding to children about how to coexist with others without discriminating against origins, and in practice, children were taught to shake hands and respect, help each other despite different ethnicities and backgrounds, guide children to always respect friends, older or younger people. The value of tolerance that is applied through the form of attention, approach, and supervision of children carried out in the orphanage will set an example for the children so that they can apply these values to their fellow residents of the orphanage as well as when they are outside the orphanage environment.

### **Democratic**

An orphanage can be likened to a class as a social life where students learn to express opinions and respect the opinions of others (Mulyasa, 2011, p. 187). The results of research conducted by Sarujin (2014), democratic values applied to orphanages will provide opportunities for children to ask questions and discuss the rules applied in orphanages, this parenting pattern is more conducive than authoritarian and permissive parenting. In democratic parenting, caregivers are also demanding but very responsive to what the children need, these kinds of caregivers also have rules and standards of behavior that must be obeyed by children, but this democratic behavior is more supportive of children being independent and responsible.

### **Obstacles in the Implementation of Character Education Values in Orphanages**

Implementing the values of character education in orphanages, of course, cannot be separated from various obstacles or obstacles faced. From the results of the research conducted, several obstacles were found which can be described as follows: Management that has not been maximized in the orphanage and has not met the standards by the results of research conducted by Sidik et al. (2022). Differences in children's backgrounds take a long time to foster and educate so that the child has a better character than before according to the results of Hidayat's research (2021). Children's willingness is still low, lack of infrastructure and human resources, and lack of planning for cooperation between orphanages and foundations in the implementation of

character education according to the research results of Afriani, Salam, and Usmanto (2021). The results of Aliyah and Sholikhah (2019) children still feel ashamed and lack self-confidence and some children still look moody and are even carried away by problems in their families. By research conducted by Lestari (2016), parenting is only limited to the cognitive and religious level, There are still childcare workers who do not emphasize character education, the social environment in schools and outside orphanages is not good, children's personalities are diverse, childcare workers do not fully understand the individuality of children, and children abuse technology. Or still breaking the rules at the orphanage. According to the research results of Sarujin (2014), the obstacles faced were the the availability of funds is few, the facilities and educational infrastructure are limited, the psychology of the children in the orphanages is different leading to difficulties in foster care, and because the Orphanages without education cannot provide education. maximum morality. By the results of Silvia and Angraini (2018) found that coaches find it difficult in the coaching process, to a lack of teachers, and coach time.

### **Efforts are Being Made to Overcome Obstacles in the Implementation of Character Education Values at The Orphanage**

Efforts made by the orphanage to overcome obstacles or obstacles in the process of implementing character education values. By the results of research conducted by Sidik et al. (2022) First, involving and giving roles to social volunteers in maximizing human resources in the process of fostering foster children and cooperating with the community in general in terms of supervision of foster children. Second, according to the results of Hidayat's (2021) research, the collaboration between coaches and caregivers makes the orphanage environment conducive and is supported by orphanage leaders who bring in competent caregivers in their respective fields. Third, according to the results of the research carried out by Aliyah and Sholikhah (2019) an attractive teaching method and the patience of caregivers are the most important factors for foster children to emulate, making the orphanage a family environment as a place for foster children to get love. like their own family, making a group of friends or playing groups greatly affects the formation of children's character, children's character will be formed when they mingle with their good friends. Fourth, according to the results of the research carried out by Lestari (2016) observations need to be made as a form of control to improve the child's personality and consultation with each orphanage administrator. Another solution is through a comprehensive personality program and fertilization of religious education.

## **CONCLUSION**

Based on the results of research and discussion, it is concluded that the implementation of character education values in orphanages comes from eighteen Pancasila values, but the most visible are religious, tolerant, and democratic values.

The obstacles faced are differences in the background of the child, it takes a long time to foster and educate the child so that the child has a better character, there are still some caregivers who do not prioritize character education, lack of infrastructure and human resources, lack of cooperative planning between orphanages. care with the foundation in the implementation of character education.

Efforts made to overcome obstacles in withinside the implementation of individual education. values are to open space to involve and provide opportunities for social volunteers to play a role in maximizing human resources in the process of fostering foster children, establishing cooperation with the community in general, especially in terms of supervision of children being cared for, developing interesting teaching methods and the patient attitude of each caregiver are very important factors for foster children to emulate.



Make the orphanage like their own family environment for foster children to get the love their own family should.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENT

N/A

#### DECLARATION OF CONFLICTING INTERESTS

The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest.

#### REFERENCES

- Afriani, O., M. Salam, M. S., & Usmanto, H. (2021). Peran panti asuhan dalam menanamkan pendidikan karakter anak asuh. *Jurnal Kewarganegaraan*, 5(2), 539–551. doi: 10.31316/jk.v5i2.1929
- Aliyah, H., & Sholikhah, T. I. (2019). Implementasi nilai pendidikan karakter berbasis iman dan taqwa di Panti Asuhan Darul Hadlanah Kota Salatiga. *Jurnal Pendidikan Glasser*, 3(2), 173-185.
- Dakir. (2019). *Manajemen pendidikan karakter; konsep dan implementasinya di sekolah dan madrasah*. Yogyakarta: K-Media.
- Hasanah, N. M., & Suwanda, I. M. (2020). Implementasi pembentukan karakter pada santri di Panti Asuhan Nurul Falah Desa Banjaragung Kecamatan Puri Kabupaten Mojokerto. *Kajian Moral dan Kewarganegaraan*, 08(2), 498–512.
- Hendriana, E. C., & Jacobus, A. (2016). Implementasi pendidikan karakter di sekolah melalui keteladanan dan pembiasaan. *Tarbawi: Jurnal Keilmuan Manajemen Pendidikan*, 1(2), 25–29.
- Hidayat, W. (2021). Implementasi Pembinaan karakter melalui pendidikan keagamaan pada anak panti asuhan. *Journal Social Society*, 1(1), 9–20.
- Indrawan, I., Wijoyo, H., Suherman, & Wiguna, I. M. A. (2020). *Manajemen pendidikan karakter*. Purwokerto Selatan: Pena Persada.
- KEMENSOS RI. (2010). KEMENSOS RI No: 77 / Huk / 2010. Retrieved from <https://peraturan.bpk.go.id/Home/Details/130263/permensos-no-77huk2010-tahun-2010>
- Latief, H. (2010). Melayani umat: Filantropi Islam dan ideologi kesejahteraan kaum modernis. Retrieved from <https://books.google.co.id/books?id=WsGHKWgtnHEC>
- Lestari, W. A. (2016). Peran lembaga kesejahteraan anak dalam menanamkan pendidikan karakter terhadap anak asuh di panti asuhan. *Jurnal Civic Hukum*, 1(2), 84–88. doi: 10.22219/jch.v1i2.10636
- Lickona, T. (2019). Pendidikan karakter: Panduan lengkap mendidik siswa menjadi pintar & baik. Retrieved from <https://books.google.co.id/books?id=3ihXEAAQBAJ>
- Lintong, M. M., Rawis, J. A., Senduk, J. F., & Lengkong, J. S. (2021). Character education management in SMA Kakaskasen Seminary Catholic and SMA Lokon St. Nikolaus Tomohon. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management and Education*, 4(2), 39–46. doi: 10.32535/apjme.v4i2
- Malviana, & Luviadi, A. (2021). Pendidikan karakter islam di yayasan panti asuhan Kota Bandar Lampung. *Jurnal Ilmu Agama Islam*, 2(1), 68–77. doi: 10.36269/ta'lim.v3i01.379
- Merentek, T C. (2022). Ringkasan buku Thomas S. Kuhn : The structure of scientific revolutions. Retrieved from <https://books.google.co.id/books?id=RGSVEAAQBAJ>
- Merentek, T. C., Sumual, H., Usuh, E. J., & Rotty, V. N. J. (2022). Penggunaan Quizizz dalam evaluasi pembelajaran pada pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia di Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Kesehatan Bethesda Tomohon. *Celebes Education Review*, 4(2), 101–109.
- Muhammad, L., Hambali., & Eddison, A. (2015). Studi tentang implementasi nilai karakter religius di Panti Asuhan As-Shohwah Kecamatan Tampan Kota Pekanbaru. *Journal Online Mahasiswa Fakultas Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan*

*Universitas Riau*, 2(2), 1–8.

- Mulyasa, H. E. (2011). *Manajemen pendidikan karakter*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Pemerintah Indonesia. (2003). Undang-undang sistem pendidikan nasional nomor 20 tahun 2003. Retrieved from file:///C:/Users/Raptor/Downloads/2019\_11\_12-03\_49\_06\_9ab7e1fa524ba603bc2cdebb7b93c3.pdf
- Pemerintah Indonesia. (2017). Perpres no 87 tahun 2017 tentang penguatan pendidikan karakter. Retrieved from [https://setkab.go.id/wp-content/uploads/2017/09/Perpres\\_Nomor\\_87\\_Tahun\\_2017.pdf](https://setkab.go.id/wp-content/uploads/2017/09/Perpres_Nomor_87_Tahun_2017.pdf)
- Ratih, N. G. A., Naharia, O., & Sumual, S. D. M. (2022). The role of the principal in the implementation of school- based management at SMK Negeri 1 Kotamobagu. *European Multidisciplinary Journal Of Modern Science*, 6, 415–422.
- Rawung, W. H., Katuuk, D. A., Rotty, V. N. J., & Lengkong, J. S. J. (2021). Kurikulum dan Tantangannya pada Abad 21. *Jurnal Bahana Manajemen Pendidikan*, 10(1), 29-34. doi: 10.24036/jbmp.v10i1.112127
- Saneba, V. H., Katuuk, D. A., Rotty, V. N. J., & Lengkong, J. S. J. (2021). Pendidikan karakter dalam upaya mendisiplinkan guru. *Jurnal Bahana Manajemen Pendidikan*, 10(1), 43-48. doi: 10.24036/jbmp.v10i1.112128
- Sani, R. A., & Kadri, M. (2016). *Pendidikan karakter: Mengembangkan karakter anak yang Islami*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Sarujin, H. (2014). Implementasi manajemen pendidikan islam dalam pembinaan akhlak mulia bagi anak panti asuhan di Kota Makassar. *Jurnal Diskursus Islam*, 2(2), 275–288. doi: 10.24252/jdi.v2i2.6524
- Sidik, M., Zohriah, A., & Firdaos, R. (2022). Implementasi manajemen pendidikan islam dalam pembinaan akhlak mulia bagi anak panti asuhan Muhammadiyah di Kota Serang. *MANAJERIAL: Jurnal Inovasi Manajemen dan Supervisi Pendidikan*, 2(2), 144–156. doi: 10.51878/manajerial.v2i2.1244
- Silvia, J. Y., & Angraini, R. (2018). Pelaksanaan pendidikan karakter di Panti Asuhan Aisyiah Kabupaten Agam. *Journal of Civic Education*, 1(2), 88–97. doi: 10.24036/jce.v1i2.200
- Snyder, H. (2019). Literature review as a research methodology: An overview and guidelines. *Journal of Business Research*, 104(C), 333–339. doi: 10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.07.039